Table of Contents

1. Introduction……..1-1
2. Method and Related Work……...……....2-1
2.1 Challenge Problem……..……2-1
2.1.1 Current State of the Art……..……..2-2
2.1.1.1 Empirical Studies……..……2-2
2.1.1.2 Simulation Studies……2-3
2.1.1.3 Analytical Studies……..……2-3
2.1.2 Proposed Advance in the State of the Art……2-4
2.2 Potential Approaches……..2-4
2.2.1 Expanded Empirical Studies……..…..2-5
2.2.2 Expanded Simulation Studies……..2-5
2.2.3 Expanded Analytical Studies……...……2-7
2.3 Selected Approach……..……2-7
2.4 Hard Problems……..……..2-8
2.4.1 Model Scale……..……2-8
2.4.2 Model Validation……...……..2-8
2.4.3 Tractable Analysis……...……2-9
2.4.4 Causal Analysis……..……..2-9
2.4.5 Experiment Selection……..……2-9
2.5 Selected Solutions and Possible Alternatives……...……2-10
2.5.1 Scale Reduction……...……..2-10
2.5.2 Sensitivity Analysis and Key Empirical Comparisons……..2-14
2.5.3 Statistical Analysis Methods……2-15
2.5.4 Data-Supported Domain Expertise……...……2-18
2.5.5 Domain Expertise and Incremental Design……..……2-20
2.6 Conclusions……..2-22
3. Description of MesoNetHS……..3-1
3.1 Model Structure……..3-1
3.1.1 Model Elements……...……3-2
3.1.1.1 Sources……..……3-2
3.1.1.2 Receivers……..3-4
3.1.1.3 Access Routers……..……3-5
3.1.1.4 Point-Of-Presence Routers……..……3-6
3.1.1.5 Backbone Routers……3-6
3.1.1.6 Backbone Links……3-7
3.1.2 Network Topology……..……3-7
3.1.2.1 Four-Tier Structure……....3-10
3.1.2.2 Heterogeneous Composition……..……3-10
3.1.2.3 Flow Classes……...……3-10
3.1.2.4 Fixed- Path Routing……...……3-11
3.1.2.5 Simulated Abilene Backbone Characteristics……..……3-11
3.1.3 Simulated Packets……..3-12
3.1.4 Relating Abstract Time to Real Time……..……..3-13

DRAFT

3.2 Model Configuration……3-14
3.2.1 Simulation Control Parameters……3-14
3.2.2 Parameters Defining User Behavior……3-14
3.2.3 Parameters Adapting Network Topology……3-15
3.2.4 Parameters Describing Sources and Receivers……3-16
3.2.5 Parameters Specifying Special Long-Lived Flows……3-18
3.2.6 Parameters for Transport Protocols……3-20
3.2.7 Parameters Identifying Monitored Links……3-21
3.2.8 Reporting Parameter Settings……3-21
3.3 Model Measurements……3-21
3.3.1 General Measurement Regime……3-21
3.3.2 Summary Measures……3-22
3.3.3 Aggregate Measures……3-23
3.3.4 Flow-Class Measures……3-26
3.3.5 Long-Lived Flow Measures……3-28
3.3.6 Per-Router Measures……3-29
3.3.6.1 Measurements Common to All Routers……3-29
3.3.6.2 Measurements Unique to Access Routers……3-31
3.3.7 Optional Link-Level Measures……3-32
3.3.8 Augmenting Measures……3-32
3.4 Tracing Flow Behavior……3-34
3.4.1 Tracing Flow States……3-34
3.4.2 Tracing Packets……3-35
3.5 Notes on Model Construction with SLX……3-35
3.5.1 Configuration File……3-35
3.5.2 Topology File……3-36
3.5.3 Model Behavior File……3-37
3.5.3.1 Model Elements……3-37
3.5.3.2 Simulation Control……3-37
3.5.3.3 Measurement Buffers……3-38
3.5.4 Performance Properties of MesoNetHS……3-38
3.5.4.1 Processing Requirements……3-39
3.5.4.2 Memory Requirements……3-40
4. Sensitivity Analysis of MesoNetHS……4-1
4.1 Methodology……4-2
4.1.1 Experiment Design……4-3
4.1.1.1 Identify Factors……4-3
4.1.1.2 Select Number of Levels and Level Settings for Factors……4-3
4.1.1.3 Select Specific Combinations to Simulate……4-4
4.1.1.4 Select Responses to Examine……4-6
4.1.2 Correlation Analysis……4-6
4.1.2.1 Y-Y Scatter Plots……4-7
4.1.2.2 Correlation Computations……4-7
4.1.2.3 Combined Matrix Visualization……4-9
4.1.2.4 Index-Index Plot……4-10

DRAFT

4.1.3 Ten-Step Graphical Analysis…….4-10
4.1.3.1 Ordered Data Plot…….……..4-11
4.1.3.2 Scatter Plot……..4-12
4.1.3.3 Main Effects Plot……4-13
4.1.3.4 Interaction Effects Matrix……..……4-14
4.1.3.5 Block Plots……..4-15
4.1.3.6 Youden Plot……4-16
4.1.3.7 |Effects| Plot……..……..4-17
4.1.3.8 Half-Normal Probability Plot of |Effects|……..…….4-18
4.1.3.9 Cumulative Residual Standard Deviation Plot…….…..4-19
4.1.3.10 Contour Plot of Two Dominant Factors……...…4-20
4.1.4 Other Exploratory Plots and Analyses……...4-21
4.2 Experiment Design for MesoNetHS Sensitivity Analysis……..…..4-23
4.2.1 MesoNetHS Factors……..……4-23
4.2.1.1 Simulation Control Parameters……..…….4-23
4.2.1.2 Parameters Controlling User Behavior……...……4-24
4.2.1.3 Parameters Adapting Network Characteristics……...…4-24
4.2.1.4 Parameters Altering Properties of Sources
and Receivers……..4-25
4.2.1.5 Parameters Controlling Source Startup Pattern……..4-26
4.2.1.6 Parameters Related to TCP Operation……4-26
4.2.1.7 Recap of Factors Selected for Sensitivity Analysis...….4-27
4.2.2 Number of Levels and Settings for MesoNetHS Factors……..4-28
4.2.2.1 Two-Level Factor Settings…….……4-28
4.2.2.2 Rationale for (and Ramifications of) Network
Factor Settings……4-28
4.2.2.3 Rationale for (and Ramifications of) User
Factor Settings……...…….4-30
4.2.2.4 Rationale for (and Ramifications of) Source
& Receiver Factor Settings……...……..4-30
4.2.2.5 Rationale for (and Ramifications of) Protocol
Factor Settings……..….4-33
4.2.3 Specific Combinations Simulated……4-33
4.2.4 Responses Examined……...……..4-33
4.2.4.1 Responses Characterizing Macroscopic
Network Behavior…….……4-34
4.2.4.2 Responses Characterizing User Experience……...4-35
4.3 Experiment Execution…….……4-36
4.3.1 Resource Requirements for Simulations……...……4-36
4.3.2 Data Collection and Summarization……..……4-38
4.4 Correlation Analysis……4-40
4.5 Principal Components Analysis……..……..4-44
4.6 Sensitivity Analysis……..……4-47
4.6.1 Sensitivity Analysis Guided by Correlation Analysis……...……4-47
4.6.1.1 Congestion-Related Responses……..……4-47
4.6.1.2 Delay-Related Responses…….……..4-51

DRAFT

4.6.1.3 Responses Related to Macroscopic Throughput……4-51
4.6.1.4 Responses Related to Advantaged Flow Classes……...4-52
4.6.2 Sensitivity Analysis Guided by Principal Component Analysis…….4-56
4.6.2.1 Congestion……..……4-56
4.6.2.2 Delay…….…..4-57
4.6.2.3 Throughput for Advantaged Flows…….4-58
4.6.2.4 Macroscopic Throughput……..……..4-60
4.6.3 Summary of Findings from the Sensitivity Analysis……...…..4-61
4.6.3.1 Main Aspects of Model Behavior…….…..4-61
4.6.3.2 Major Factors Influencing Model Behavior…….…..4-63
4.6.3.3 Factors Exhibiting Little Influence on Model Behavior……...……..4-64
4.7 Exploring Effects of Buffer Sizing…….……..4-65
4.7.1 Effects on Delay Variation……...……4-66
4.7.2 Effects on Other Aspects of Network Behavior……..…..4-67
4.8 Conclusions……..4-70
5. Modeling Alternate Congestion-Control Mechanisms…….5-1
5.1 TCP Congestion Control……..…….…….5-2
5.1.1 Connection Phase…….…….……..5-3
5.1.2 Transfer Phase – Slow Start…….……5-5
5.1.2.1 Standard Slow Start……..……5-6
5.1.2.2 Limited Slow Start……...…….5-6
5.1.2.3 Setting Slow-Start Threshold……..……..5-6
5.1.3 Transfer Phase – Congestion Avoidance…….……..……..5-7
5.1.3.1 Increase Congestion Window after Acknowledgment…….5-7
5.1.3.2 Decrease Congestion Window After Signaled Loss……..5-7
5.1.3.3 Decrease Slow-Start Threshold and Reset Congestion Window after Timeout……..……5-8
5.1.3.4 Combined Effects of Slow Start and Congestion Avoidance…….5-8
5.2 Congestion-Avoidance Procedures for Six Alternate Congestion-Control Mechanisms…….……...…….5-10
5.2.1 BIC……..…….……..……5-10
5.2.1.1 Increase Procedures……..…..5-11
5.2.1.2 Decrease Procedures……...……5-11
5.2.1.3 Timeout Procedures……..…..5-12
5.2.2 CTCP…….……...……5-13
5.2.2.1 Increase Procedures……..…..5-14
5.2.2.2 Decrease Procedures……...……5-14
5.2.2.3 Timeout Procedures……..…..5-15
5.2.2.4 Periodic Procedures……5-15
5.2.3 FAST…….……...……5-15
5.2.3.1 Increase Procedures……..…..5-17

DRAFT

5.2.3.2 Decrease Procedures……5-17
5.2.3.3 Timeout Procedures……5-17
5.2.3.4 Periodic Procedures……5-17
5.2.4 HSTCP……5-18
5.2.3.1 Increase Procedures……5-18
5.2.3.2 Decrease Procedures……5-19
5.2.3.3 Timeout Procedures……5-19
5.2.5 H-TCP……5-19
5.2.5.1 Increase Procedures……5-19
5.2.5.2 Decrease Procedures……5-20
5.2.5.3 Timeout Procedures……5-21
5.2.5.4 Periodic Procedures……5-21
5.2.6 Scalable TCP……5-21
5.2.6.1 Increase Procedures……5-22
5.2.6.2 Decrease Procedures……5-22
5.2.6.3 Timeout Procedures……5-22
5.3 Modeling the Transfer Phase in MesoNetHS……5-23
5.3.1 General Data Transfer Procedures……5-23
5.3.2 Slow Start……5-24
5.3.3 Congestion Avoidance……5-24
5.3.3.1 Acknowledgement Procedures……5-25
5.3.3.2 Negative Acknowledgement Procedures……5-25
5.3.3.3 Periodic Procedures……5-25
5.3.3.4 Timeout Procedures……5-25
5.4 Verifying Simulated Congestion-Control Mechanisms……5-25
5.4.1 Standard TCP Congestion-Control Model……5-27
5.4.2 Behavior of BIC Congestion-Control Model……5-28
5.4.3 Behavior of CTCP Congestion-Control Model……5-29
5.4.4 Behavior of FAST Congestion-Control Model……5-30
5.4.5 Behavior of HSTCP Congestion-Control Model……5-37
5.4.6 Behavior of H-TCP Congestion-Control Model……5-38
5.4.7 Behavior of Scalable TCP Congestion-Control Model……5-38
5.4.8 Summary of Behavior of MesoNetHS Congestion-Control Models……5-38
6. Comparing Congestion-Control Regimes in a Large, Fast Network……6-1
6.1 Experiment Design……6-1
6.1.1 Simulation Parameters……6-3
6.1.2 Conditions Simulated……6-7
6.1.3 Responses Measured……6-8
6.1.3.1 Measures of Macroscopic Behavior……6-8
6.1.3.2 Measures of User Experience……6-10
6.1.3.3 Measures of Buffer Usage……6-11
6.1.3.4 Aggregate Measures……6-12
6.2 Experiment Execution and Data Collection……6-13
6.2.1 Experiment Execution……6-13
6.2.2 Data Collection……6-16

DRAFT

6.3 Data-Analysis Approach…….…….……6-17
6.3.1 Cluster Analysis……...…….……6-17
6.3.2 Detailed Analysis of Individual Responses…….…….……6-22
6.3.3 Condition-Response Summary Analysis…..……6-24
6.3.4 Data Exploration……6-26
6.3.4.1 Extrapolating from Time Series……...……..6-26
6.3.4.2 Seeking Patterns…….……6-29
6.3.4.3 Investigating Data Subsets…….……6-30
6.3.4.4 Interactive Animation……6-31
6.4 Results…….……6-32
6.4.1 Time Period One (TP1)….…….……..……6-32
6.4.1.1 Cluster Analysis for TP1……...……6-33
6.4.1.2 Condition-Response Summary for TP1……..6-33
6.4.1.3 Analysis of Significant Responses for TP1……6-33
6.4.1.4 Summary of Results for TP1……...……....6-38
6.4.2 Time Period Two (TP2)….…….……..……6-38
6.4.2.1 Cluster Analysis for TP2……...……6-38
6.4.2.2 Condition-Response Summary for TP2……..6-39
6.4.2.3 Analysis of Significant Responses for TP2……6-40
6.4.2.4 Summary of Results for TP2……..……...….6-40
6.4.3 Time Period Two (TP3)….…….……..……6-45
6.4.3.1 Cluster Analysis for TP3……...……6-45
6.4.3.2 Condition-Response Summary for TP3……..6-45
6.4.3.3 Analysis of Significant Responses for TP3……6-45
6.4.3.4 Summary of Results for TP3……..……...….6-51
6.4.4 Aggregated Responses (Totals)……..….……..……6-51
6.4.4.1 Cluster Analysis for Totals…….……...……6-51
6.4.4.2 Condition-Response Summary for Totals……..6-52
6.4.4.3 Analysis of Significant Responses for Totals….……6-52
6.4.4.4 Summary of Results for Totals…….……..……...….6-55
6.5 Findings……..…….……6-55
6.5.1 Finding #1…….……...……..6-55
6.5.2 Finding #2…….……..……...….6-58
6.5.3 Finding #3…….…….…...……..6-63
6.5.4 Finding #4……..……6-65
6.5.5 Tendencies……...……..6-66
6.6 Conclusions……..6-67
7. Comparing Congestion-Control Regimes in a Scaled-Down Network……..…….....7-1
7.1 Experiment Design……..…….……..7-2
7.1.1 Changes in Robustness Factors and Fixed Factors…….……7-2
7.1.2 Orthogonal Fractional Factorial Design of Robustness Conditions...……7-3
7.1.3 Domain View of Robustness Conditions…….……7-4
7.2 Experiment Execution and Data Collection……...……7-8
7.3 Data-Analysis Approach……...…..7-8
7.4 Results…….……7-10

DRAFT

7.4.1 Time Period One (TP1)……..……..7-11
7.4.1.1 Cluster Analysis for TP1……7-11
7.4.1.2 Condition-Response Summary for TP1…….7-12
7.4.1.3 Analysis of Significant Responses for TP1……..……..7-12
7.4.1.4 Summary of Results for TP1…….…….7-18
7.4.2 Time Period Two (TP2)……..……..7-19
7.4.2.1 Cluster Analysis for TP2……7-19
7.4.2.2 Condition-Response Summary for TP2…….7-19
7.4.2.3 Analysis of Significant Responses for TP2……..……..7-19
7.4.2.4 Summary of Results for TP2…….…….7-19
7.4.3 Time Period Two (TP3)……..……..7-26
7.4.3.1 Cluster Analysis for TP3……7-26
7.4.3.2 Condition-Response Summary for TP3…….7-26
7.4.3.3 Analysis of Significant Responses for TP3……..……..7-26
7.4.3.4 Summary of Results for TP3…….…….7-26
7.4.4 Aggregated Responses (Totals)…….7-26
7.4.4.1 Cluster Analysis for Totals…….……7-32
7.4.4.2 Condition-Response Summary for Totals…….…….7-32
7.4.4.3 Analysis of Significant Responses for Totals…...……..7-34
7.4.4.4 Summary of Results for Totals.….…….7-34
7.5 Findings……..…….7-37
7.5.1 Finding #1……..……7-37
7.5.2 Finding #2……..……7-39
7.5.3 Finding #3…….……7-40
7.5.4 Finding #4…….…7-58
7.5.5 Tendencies…….……7-59
7.6 Conclusions……..7-60
8. Comparing Congestion-Control Regimes in an Evolving Network……..……..…8-1
8.1 Experiment Design…….……8-2
8.1.1 Robustness Factors and Fixed Factors…….…8-2
8.1.1.1 Constraints on Flows of Large Size……..8-5
8.1.1.2 Fixed Experiment Factors…….……8-7
8.1.2 Orthogonal Fractional Factorial Design of Robustness Conditions……..…….8-9
8.1.3 Domain View of Robustness Conditions…….……..8-10
8.1.4 Responses Measured……..8-15
8.2 Experiment Execution and Data Collection…….……8-16
8.2.1 Computing Macroscopic Responses…….8-17
8.2.2 Computing User-Experience Responses…….……..8-20
8.3 Data-Analysis Approach……..8-21
8.3.1 Analyzing Macroscopic Behavior……...……..8-21
8.3.2 Analyzing User Experience……..8-22
8.4 Results…….8-27
8.4.1 Macroscopic Network Behavior……..…….8-27
8.4.1.1 High Initial Slow-start Threshold…….…….8-27
8.4.1.2 Low Initial Slow-start Threshold……..8-32

8.4.2 Absolute User Experience……..……..8-37
8.4.2.1 High Initial Slow-start Threshold…….…….8-37
8.4.2.2 Low Initial Slow-start Threshold……..8-46
8.4.2.3 Summary of Differences in Goodput……8-55
8.4.3 Relative User Experience……8-57
8.4.3.1 High Initial Slow-start Threshold…….…….8-57
8.4.2.2 Low Initial Slow-start Threshold……..8-65
8.4.2.3 Summary of Differences in Relative Goodput……..…8-55
8.5 Findings……8-75
8.5.1 Finding #1…….…….8-75
8.5.2 Finding #2……..8-76
8.5.3 Finding #3…….…….8-76
8.5.4 Finding #4…….…….8-76
8.6 Conclusions……..……8-77
9. Comparing Congestion-Control Regimes in a Large, Fast, Evolving Network……...9-1
9.1 Changes in Experiment Design……..9-2
9.1.1 Changes in Robustness Factors and Fixed Factors…….9-2
9.1.2 Changes in Orthogonal Fractional Factorial Design of Robustness Conditions……9-3
9.1.3 Changes in Domain View of Robustness Conditions……..……9-4
9.1.4 Responses Measured……..…….9-6
9.2 Experiment Execution and Data Collection……..…….9-6
9.3 Data-Analysis Approach…….……9-6
9.4 Results……9-7
9.4.1 Macroscopic Network Behavior…….…….9-7
9.4.2 Absolute User Experience……...……..9-13
9.4.3 Relative User Experience……...……...9-21
9.5 Findings……9-32
9.5.1 Finding #1……..……9-32
9.5.2 Finding #2……..9-32
9.5.3 Finding #3……..9-32
9.5.4 Finding #4…….…….9-33
9.6 Conclusions
10. Conclusions……..10-1
10.1 Conclusions about Congestion-Control Algorithms……..10-1
10.1.1 Utility and Safety of Alternate Congestion-Control Algorithms…….……..10-1
10.1.1.1 Increase Rate……10-1
10.1.1.2 Loss/Recovery Processing…...…….10-2
10.1.1.3 Fairness…….……10-3
10.1.1.4 Utility Bounds…….…….10-4
10.1.1.5 Safety……10-5
10.1.2 Characteristics of Individual Congestion-Control Algorithms…….……..10-6
10.2.1 BIC…….……..……10-6
10.2.2 CTCP……..……10-6

DRAFT

10.2.3 FAST……..……..10-7
10.2.4 FAST-AT……..……..……..10-7
10.2.5 HSTCP……..……10-7
10.2.6 HTCP……..……10-8
10.2.7 Scalable TCP……...……10-8
10.1.3 Recommendations……..……..10-9
10.1.4 Future Work……..……10-9
10.2 Conclusions about Methods……..10-10
10.2.1 Discrete-Event Simulation……..……..10-10
10.2.2 Scale-Reduction Techniques……..……10-11
10.2.2.1 Mode Restriction and Parameter Clustering……..…10-11
10.2.2.2 Two-Level Experiment Designs……10-11
10.2.2.3 Orthogonal Fractional Factorial Experiment Designs……..…10-11
10.2.2.4 Correlation Analysis……...……10-12
10.2.2.5 Principal Components Analysis……..10-12
10.2.3 Model-Validation Techniques……..……10-13
10.2.3.1 Sensitivity Analysis……..……10-13
10.2.3.2 Key Empirical Comparisons……..……10-13
10.2.4 Data-Analysis Methods……10-14
10.2.4.1 Ten-Step Graphical Analysis……10-14
10.2.4.2 Cluster Analysis……..10-15
10.2.4.3 Custom Multidimensional Visualizations……..…10-15
10.2.4.4 Exploratory Multidimensional Interactive Visualization……..10-15
10.2.5 Causality-Analysis Methods……10-16
10.2.5.1 Principal Components Analysis……10-16
10.2.5.2 Detailed Measurements……..10-16
10.2.5.3 Scientific Method……..……10-17
10.2.5.4 Exploratory Analysis……..……10-18
10.2.6 Experiment-Selection Methods……10-18
10.2.6.1 Rank Analysis……..……10-18
10.2.6.2 Domain Expertise……..……10-18
10.2.6.3 Incremental Design……..……10-18
10.2.7 Recommendations……10-19
10.2.8 Future Work……..10-20
11. Bibliography of References……...……..……...……11-1
11.1 Fundamentals of Internet Design……11-1
11.2 Standard Transmission Control Protocol (TCP)…...……..11-1
11.3 Internet Topology……..……..11-2
11.4 Internet Traffic Characteristics……..……11-3
11.5 Internet Topology……..……11-3
11.6 Research on Data Transport in High-Speed, High-Delay Networks……..…11-4
11.7 Proposed Replacement Congestion-Control Mechanisms for the Internet……...……11-4

11.8 Evaluating Internet Congestion-Control Mechanisms……..……11-5
11.9 Internet Simulation and Models……...……..11-6
11.10 Supporting Software Tools……...……11-7
11.11 Supporting Statistical Techniques……11-7
11.12 Empirical Internet Test Beds……...……11-7
11.13 General Related References……..11-8
11.14 Analytical Network Models…….……11-8
Appendix A. Understanding and Improving Fluid-Flow Models…….…..A-1
Appendix B. Computational Requirements: MesoNet vs. Hybrid Model.....….…….B-1
B.1 Experiment Design……...….B-1
B.2 Experiment Execution and Data Collection…….……B-6
B.3 Results……...……B-7
B.4 Discussion…….……B-7
B.5 Conclusions……..……B-8
Appendix C. Supplementary Sensitivity Analysis Results…….…....…….C-1
C.1 Experiment Design……C-1
C.2 Experiment Execution and Data Collection…….…….C-6
C.3 Results……..……C-8
C.3.1 Correlation Analysis……..……C-8
C.3.2 Principal Components Analysis…….……..C-10
C.3.3 Exploratory Analysis of y7-y22 Scatter Plot Bifurcation……C-13
C.3.4 Main Effects Analysis……..C-13
C.3.4.1 Congestion-Related Responses……...……..C-14
C.3.4.2 Delay-Related Responses…….……C-18
C.3.4.3 Responses Related to Macroscopic Throughput……...C-18
C.3.4.4 Responses Related to Advantaged Flow Classes……..C-21
C.3.5 Summary of Findings from Sensitivity Analysis……...…..C-23
C.3.6 Exploring Effects of Buffer Sizing……...……C-24
C.4 Discussion…….……..C-26
C.5 Conclusions…….……C-28

DRAFT